

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

NORCA INDUSTRIAL, LLC, a New York  
Limited Liability Company,

Plaintiff,

v.

ROBERT WREN, an individual; PRIMROSE  
METALS, INC., a California corporation;  
RICHARD RAYBIN, an individual; LIFETIME  
CAPITAL GROUP, an unknown entity;  
VICTORIA PICOLOTTI, an individual;  
PRIMROSE ALLOYS, INC., a California  
corporation; CRAIG YARDE, an individual;  
STEVE SONG, an individual;

Defendants.

CASE NO. C07-3425 WHA

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords extends only to the limited

1 information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to treatment as  
2 confidential. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 10, below, that this Stipulated  
3 Protective Order creates no entitlement to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule  
4 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards that will be applied  
5 when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

6  
7 **2. DEFINITIONS**

8 **2.1 Party:** any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,  
9 employees, consultants, retained experts, and outside counsel (and their support staff).

10 **2.2 Disclosure or Discovery Material:** all items or information, regardless of the  
11 medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,  
12 transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to  
13 discovery in this matter.

14 **2.3 "Confidential" Information or Items:** information (regardless of how  
15 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under standards  
16 developed under F.R.Civ.P. 26(c).

17 **2.4 "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only" Information or Items:**  
18 extremely sensitive "Confidential Information or Items" whose disclosure to another Party or  
19 nonparty would create a substantial risk of serious injury that could not be avoided by less  
20 restrictive means.

21 **2.5 Receiving Party:** a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from  
22 a Producing Party.

23 **2.6 Producing Party:** a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery  
24 Material in this action.

25 **2.7 Designating Party:** a Party or non-party that designates information or items  
26 that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "Confidential" or "Highly  
27 Confidential — Attorneys' Eyes Only."

28 **2.8 Protected Material:** any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated

as “Confidential” or as “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

2.9 Outside Counsel: attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who are retained to represent or advise a Party in this action.

2.10 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a Party.

2.11 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well as their support staffs).

2.12 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party’s and who, at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party’s. This definition includes a professional jury or trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.

2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and subcontractors.

### 3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

### 4. DURATION

Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs.

1           5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

2                   5.1     Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each  
3 Party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take  
4 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.  
5 A Designating Party must take care to designate for protection only those parts of material,  
6 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the  
7 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
8 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

9                   Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
10 shown to be clearly unjustified, or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
11 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process, or to impose unnecessary expenses  
12 and burdens on other parties), expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

13                   If it comes to a Party's or a non-party's attention that information or items that it  
14 designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all, or do not qualify for the level of  
15 protection initially asserted, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties that it is  
16 withdrawing the mistaken designation.

17                   5.2     Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this  
18 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a), below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,  
19 material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the  
20 material is disclosed or produced.

21                   Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

22                           (a) for information in documentary form (apart from transcripts of  
23 depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend  
24 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" at the top of  
25 each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page  
26 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g.,  
27 by making appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of  
28 protection being asserted (either "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL –

1 ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY").

2 A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available  
 3 for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
 4 which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the  
 5 designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "HIGHLY  
 6 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." After the inspecting Party has identified the  
 7 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or  
 8 portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified  
 9 documents, the Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend ("CONFIDENTIAL" or  
 10 "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY") at the top of each page that  
 11 contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for  
 12 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making  
 13 appropriate markings in the margins) and must specify, for each portion, the level of protection  
 14 being asserted (either "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS'  
 15 EYES ONLY").

16 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings,  
 17 that the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the record, before the  
 18 close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony, and further specify  
 19 any portions of the testimony that qualify as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES  
 20 ONLY." When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to  
 21 protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for  
 22 protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the testimony may invoke on the  
 23 record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to have up to 20 days to identify  
 24 the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is sought and to specify the level of  
 25 protection being asserted ("CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS'  
 26 EYES ONLY"). Only those portions of the testimony that are appropriately designated for  
 27 protection within the 20 days shall be covered by the provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

28 Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound by

the court reporter, who must affix to the top of each such page the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,” as instructed by the Party or nonparty offering or sponsoring the witness or presenting the testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary, and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” If only portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portions, specifying whether they qualify as “Confidential” or as “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only.”

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only” does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. If material is appropriately designated as “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only” after the material was initially produced, the Receiving Party, on timely notification of the designation, must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a later significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

6.2 Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a Designating Party’s confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) with counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring, the challenging Party must explain the basis

1 for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party  
2 an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change  
3 in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A challenging Party may  
4 proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer  
5 process first.

6           6.3     Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a  
7 confidentiality designation after considering the justification offered by the Designating Party may  
8 file and serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if  
9 applicable) that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail the basis for the challenge.  
10 Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration that affirms that the movant  
11 has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph and that  
12 sets forth with specificity the justification for the confidentiality designation that was given by the  
13 Designating Party in the meet and confer dialogue.

14           The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the  
15 Designating Party. Until the court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the  
16 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's  
17 designation.

## 18 19           7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

20           7.1     Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
21 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for  
22 prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be  
23 disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When  
24 the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 11,  
25 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

26           Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location  
27 and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this  
28 Order.

1                   7.2     Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise  
 2 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may  
 3 disclose any information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only to:

4                   (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of record in this action, as well as  
 5 employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this  
 6 litigation and who have signed the “Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order” that is attached  
 7 hereto as Exhibit A;

8                   (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the  
 9 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed  
 10 the “Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order” (Exhibit A);

11                   (c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
 12 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Agreement to Be  
 13 Bound by Protective Order” (Exhibit A);

14                   (d) the Court and its personnel;

15                   (e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure  
 16 is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Agreement to Be Bound by  
 17 Protective Order” (Exhibit A);

18                   (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is  
 19 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order”  
 20 (Exhibit A). Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
 21 Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to  
 22 anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

23                   (g) the author of the document or the original source of the information.

24                   7.3     Disclosure of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”  
 25 Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the  
 26 Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “HIGHLY  
 27 CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” only to:

28                   (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of record in this action, as well as



employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

*[(b) – Optional – as deemed appropriate in case-specific circumstances:*

House Counsel of a Receiving Party (1) who has no involvement in competitive decision-making or in patent prosecutions involving \_\_\_\_\_ [specify subject matter areas], (2) to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, and (3) who has signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) (1) to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, (2) who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A), *[Optional: and (3) as to whom the procedures set forth in paragraph 7.4, below, have been followed];*

(d) the Court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A); and

(f) the author of the document or the original source of the information.

*[ Optional: 7.4 Procedures for Approving Disclosure of "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" Information or Items to "Experts"*

(a) Unless otherwise ordered by the court or agreed in writing by the Designating Party, a Party that seeks to disclose to an "Expert" (as defined in this Order) any information or item that has been designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" first must make a written request to the Designating Party that (1) identifies the specific HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information that the Receiving Party seeks permission to disclose to the Expert, (2) sets forth the full name of the Expert and the city and state of his or her primary residence, (3) attaches a copy of the Expert's current resume, (4) identifies the Expert's current employer(s), (5) identifies each person or entity from whom the Expert has received compensation for work in his or her areas of expertise or to whom the expert has provided professional services at

1 any time during the preceding five years, and (6) identifies (by name and number of the case, filing  
2 date, and location of court) any litigation in connection with which the Expert has provided any  
3 professional services during the preceding five years.

4 (b) A Party that makes a request and provides the information specified in  
5 the preceding paragraph may disclose the subject Protected Material to the identified Expert unless,  
6 within seven court days of delivering the request, the Party receives a written objection from the  
7 Designating Party. Any such objection must set forth in detail the grounds on which it is based.

8 (c) A Party that receives a timely written objection must meet and confer  
9 with the Designating Party (through direct voice to voice dialogue) to try to resolve the matter by  
10 agreement. If no agreement is reached, the Party seeking to make the disclosure to the Expert may  
11 file a motion as provided in Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if  
12 applicable) seeking permission from the court to do so. Any such motion must describe the  
13 circumstances with specificity, set forth in detail the reasons for which the disclosure to the Expert  
14 is reasonably necessary, assess the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail and suggest any  
15 additional means that might be used to reduce that risk. In addition, any such motion must be  
16 accompanied by a competent declaration in which the movant describes the parties' efforts to  
17 resolve the matter by agreement (i.e., the extent and the content of the meet and confer discussions)  
18 and sets forth the reasons advanced by the Designating Party for its refusal to approve the  
19 disclosure.

20 In any such proceeding the Party opposing disclosure to the Expert shall bear the  
21 burden of proving that the risk of harm that the disclosure would entail (under the safeguards  
22 proposed) outweighs the Receiving Party's need to disclose the Protected Material to its Expert.

23  
24 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER  
25 LITIGATION.

26 If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation  
27 that would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as  
28 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY," the

1 Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by fax, if possible) immediately  
2 and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such notification  
3 must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.

4 The Receiving Party also must immediately inform in writing the Party who caused  
5 the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the  
6 subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party must  
7 deliver a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order promptly to the Party in the other action that  
8 caused the subpoena or order to issue.

9 The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence  
10 of this Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to  
11 protect its confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The  
12 Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court of its  
13 confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or  
14 encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

#### 15 16 9. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

17 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
18 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective  
19 Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the  
20 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the Protected Material, (c)  
21 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this  
22 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to  
23 Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

#### 24 25 10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL

26 Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after  
27 appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action  
28 any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply

1 with Civil Local Rule 79-5.

2  
3 11. FINAL DISPOSITION

4 Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty days  
5 after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to  
6 the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies,  
7 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of reproducing or capturing any of the  
8 Protected Material. With permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party  
9 may destroy some or all of the Protected Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected  
10 Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the  
11 Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the sixty day  
12 deadline that identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned  
13 or destroyed and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,  
14 compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.  
15 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings,  
16 motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence or attorney work product, even if  
17 such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute  
18 Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION),  
19 above.

20  
21 12. MISCELLANEOUS

22 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any  
23 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

24 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this  
25 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or  
26 producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order.  
27 Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the  
28 material covered by this Protective Order.

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 Dated: July [26], 2007

PHILLIPS, ERLEWINE & GIVEN LLP

3

4

By: /s/ R. Scott Erlewine  
R. SCOTT ERLEWINE

5

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
NORCA INDUSTRIAL LLC

6

7

Dated: July [25], 2007

STONE ROSENBLATT & CHA

8

9

By: /s/ John Cha  
JOHN S. CHA

10

Attorneys for Defendants  
ROBERT WREN, VICTORIA PICLOTTI,  
PRIMROSE ALLOYS, INC., and CRAIG YARDE

11

12

13

Dated: July [25], 2007

CARR & FERRELL *LLP*

14

15

By: /s/ Stuart Clark  
STUART C. CLARK

16

Attorneys for Defendants  
PRIMROSE METALS, INC., RICHARD RAYBIN,  
and LIFETIME CAPITAL GROUP

17

18

19

20 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

21

22

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
HON. WILLIAM ALSUP  
United States District Judge

23

24

25

26

27

28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and  
understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for  
the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of **NORCA INDUSTRIAL, LLC, v.  
ROBERT WREN, et al. (Case No. C07-3425 WHA)**. I agree to comply with and to be bound by  
all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so  
comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly  
promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this  
Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions  
of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the  
Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective  
Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of  
\_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and telephone number]  
as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings  
related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_  
[printed name]

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
[signature]